Appointmen of the
Chief Commissioner of
the Independent
Commission for Aid
Impact

Seventh Report of Session 2014–15

Report, together with formal minutes

Ordered by the House of Commons
to be printed 9 December 2014
The International Development Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Office of the Secretary of State for International Development Committee.

**Current membership**

- **Rt Hon Sir Malcolm Bruce MP** (Liberal Democrat, Gordon) (Chair)
- Hugh Bayley MP (Labour, York Central)
- Fiona Bruce MP (Conservative, Congleton)
- Sir Tony Cunningham MP (Labour, Workington)
- Fabian Hamilton MP (Labour, Leeds North East)
- Pauline Latham OBE MP (Conservative, Mid Derbyshire)
- Jeremy Lefroy MP (Conservative, Stafford)
- Sir Peter Luff MP (Conservative, Mid Worcestershire)
- Mr Michael McCann MP (Labour, East Kilbride, Strathaven and Lesmahagow)
- Fiona O’Donnell MP (Labour, East Lothian)
- Chris White MP (Conservative, Warwick and Leamington)

The following member was also a member of the committee during the parliament:

- Mr Russell Brown MP (Labour, Dumfries, Galloway)
- Richard Burden MP (Labour, Birmingham, Northfield)
- Mr James Clappison MP (Conservative, Hertsmere)
- Mr Sam Gyimah MP (Conservative, East Surrey)
- Richard Harrington MP (Conservative, Watford)
- Alison McGovern MP (Labour, Wirral South)
- Ann McKechnie MP (Labour, Glasgow North)
- Mark Pritchard MP (Conservative, The Wrekin)
- Anas Sarwar MP (Labour, Glasgow Central)

**Powers**

The committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the internet via www.parliament.uk.

**Publication**

Committee reports are published on the Committee’s website at www.parliament.uk/indcom and by The Stationary Office by Order of the House.

Evidence relating to this report is published on the Committee's website at Appointment of the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

**Committee staff**

The current staff of the Committee are Dr David Harrison (Clerk), Chloe Challender (Senior Adviser), Louise Whitley (Committee Specialist), Richard Ratcliffe (Committee Specialist), Zac Mead (Senior Committee Assistant), Paul Hampson, (Committee Support Assistant) and Rosie Tate (Media Officer).

**Contacts**

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the International Development Committee, House of Commons, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 1223; the Committee’s email address is indcom@parliament.uk
## Contents

### Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 ICAI and the post of Chief Commissioner</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The candidate</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The appointment process</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1: Chief Commissioner Independent Commission for Aid Impact – Information Pack for Applicants</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2: Letter from Secretary of State for International Development</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3: CV of Dr Alison Evans</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4: DFID Summary of recruitment process</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 5: Letter from Secretary of State to Fabian Hamilton MP dated 12 June 2014</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 6: Letter from Secretary of State to Rt Hon Sir Malcolm Bruce MP dated 14 October 2014</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Formal Minutes

27

### Witnesses

28

### Published written evidence

28

### List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

29
Summary

The Chief Commissioner of ICAI has a crucial role in scrutinising aid spending by the UK Government, reporting to Parliament through this Committee. We are pleased to endorse the appointment of Dr Alison Evans to this post, but we recommend that at least one of the existing Commissioners be reappointed for a further term to ensure continuity, and that one of the Commissioners be an audit professional.

The selection process used resulted in an unranked list of four candidates deemed “appointable” being presented to the Secretary of State for consideration. This puts too much power in the hands of the Secretary of State for an independent scrutiny post and threatens to undermine the candidate in the eyes of the public who may assume that the candidate most sympathetic to DFID was chosen. We recommend that panels for ICAI Commissioner appointments should be invited to rank candidates or otherwise advise the Secretary of State as they see fit. In the longer term, we recommend the Committee be able to choose the Chief Commissioner from the list of candidates.
1 ICAI and the post of Chief Commissioner

1. The Independent Commission on Aid Impact (ICAI) was established in May 2011 as a Non-Departmental Public Body (NDPB) sponsored by the Department for International Development (DFID). ICAI's strategic aims are to provide independent scrutiny of UK aid spending, and to promote the delivery of value for money for British taxpayers and the maximisation of the impact of aid.

2. We have scrutinised the work of ICAI since its inception. We had some concerns about its early work, but we noted considerable improvement and it has now produced a number of strong reports.

3. The Commission is headed by a Chief Commissioner who is responsible for:
   a) overseeing delivery of high quality, accessible and professionally credible reviews through a contracted out service provider and supported by a small Secretariat;
   b) representing ICAI and communicating its reports to the UK public and International stakeholders, through report publication and transparency of information on the ICAI website;
   c) reporting to Parliament, including appearing before the International Development Committee at public evidence sessions;
   d) contributing to strengthening the impact of UK aid, through monitoring implementation and providing feedback to Government;
   e) maintaining the independence of ICAI, while managing the relationship with DFID and other government departments; and
   f) managing the performance of the three other Commissioners.

4. The post of Chief Commissioner was advertised in May 2014. The job specification sought a candidate with:
   a) the profile to command respect and credibility with Parliament and external stakeholders;
   b) experience in an international development context as well as broad understanding of public policy and interest in international affairs;
   c) independence from Government and specific interest groups (where there could be potential conflicts of interest);
   d) a strong track record in scrutiny (private, public or voluntary sector experience);
   e) the ability to represent ICAI effectively to a broad range of domestic and international audiences including the UK Parliament; and
   f) ability to adhere to the Seven Principles of Public Life and the highest levels of professional integrity and propriety.
5. The Secretary of State for International Development wrote to our Chair on 23 July 2014 informing him that her proposed candidate for Chief Commissioner was Dr Alison Evans. The Secretary of State acknowledged our intention to hold a pre-appointment hearing and provided various documents that are appended to this Report. We received evidence about the appointment process from the outgoing Chief Commissioner, Graham Ward, and questioned Richard Calvert, DFID Director General and a member of the selection panel. We took evidence from Dr Alison Evans at a pre-appointment hearing on 9 December 2014.

6. The appointment is for a four year term with a requirement to apply “in the region of” 65 days per annum to the role. The current Chief Commissioner claims for about 80 days per year, though he estimates that he works around 16 further days unpaid. He considers that 80 days per year would be appropriate to carry out the role effectively. The Secretary of State has indicated there is room for some flexibility about the number of days. In light of the experience of the previous Chief Commissioner and the evidence of how Dr Evans viewed the role, we recommend that the number of remunerated days for the post of Chief Commissioner of ICAI be increased to 90.

---

1 HC 684, Q49 ff.
2 He recorded 80.5 days in the year to May 2014, largely because a Commissioner was unavailable; but estimates he worked, but did not record or claim for, an additional 16 days.
3 Letter from Rt Hon Justine Greening MP to Fabian Hamilton MP dated 12 June 2014, appended.
2 The candidate

7. During the evidence session we questioned Dr Evans about, in particular:

   a) real or perceived conflicts of interest in relation to a number of posts she holds or has held and how she thought she would deal such conflicts;

   b) the relationship of ICAI with us and with DFID;

   c) the future of ICAI; and

   d) her expertise.

8. Dr Evans has a high degree of professional competence. She has a great deal of experience in international development and is an economist by training. She has for some time been involved at a high level with organisations working in the overseas development field, and that involvement continues to date. We are pleased to endorse the appointment of Dr Alison Evans to the post of Chief Commissioner of ICAI.

9. However, Dr Evans is not an audit professional and will take office in May 2015 at the same time as all other Commissioners’ non-renewable terms end. We are concerned about the risk to continuity. The Secretary of State has decided to re-advertise for Commissioner candidates as DFID is “disappointed not to have attracted the very high calibre of candidates that [it] had expected”. The Framework Agreement between ICAI and DFID could be amended to permit re-appointment, subject to the Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies’ limits.

10. Accordingly, while we are pleased to endorse the appointment of Dr Alison Evans, we recommend that:

   a) at least one of the existing Commissioners—if willing to serve—be reappointed for a further term; and that the Framework Agreement be amended to permit service for up to ten years; and

   b) one of the Commissioners appointed should be an audit professional.

---


5 Letter from Rt Hon Justine Greening MP to Rt Hon Sir Malcolm Bruce MP dated 14 October 2014, appended.


7 Of 10 years: Commissioner for Public Appointments, Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies (2012), para 10.1. The previous code (April 2009) imposed an additional restriction of two terms in office before a further open competition was required (para 5.28).
3 The appointment process

11. The Chief Commissioner reports to us through our sub-Committee on ICAI. We therefore welcomed the inclusion of Fabian Hamilton MP, the Chair of that sub-Committee, on the selection panel for the post. He did not participate in the oral evidence session or our deliberations about this Report.

12. The Commissioner for Public Appointments' Code of Practice for ministerial appointments states that the selection process must be agreed between the panel and the Minister at the outset of the competition. The panel must give Ministers a choice of candidates assessed appointable, unless only one is found to be suitable. The selection panel for Chief Commissioner of ICAI submitted to the Secretary of State a shortlist of four appointable candidates, all those it had interviewed. The panel was not invited to rank the candidates or otherwise indicate its preferences.

13. Though not inviting panels to rank appointable candidates is common practice, the particular characteristics of this post demand less ministerial discretion:

   a) ICAI’s role is to scrutinise the Government;

   b) the Chair of our sub-Committee on ICAI, Fabian Hamilton MP, was on the selection panel;

   c) the Government’s *Triennial Review of ICAI* concluded that it would be helpful “to invite a member of the IDC to serve on the selection panel “that makes recommendations to Ministers”. We do not think merely vetting candidates as “appointable” is within the spirit of making “recommendations”;

   d) most importantly, ICAI is an independent body reporting directly to Parliament through us, with similarities to the relationship between the National Audit Office and the Public Accounts Committee/Commission.

14. An unranked shortlist of four is not a desirable outcome from a robust selection process. It gives the Secretary of State undue influence given the Chief Commissioner is an independent scrutineer of Government. It risks the accusation that the appointee is the one the Secretary of State considers most biddable, potentially undermining the candidate in the eyes of the public.

15. We recommend that when a selection panel is convened for the purpose of appointing the Commissioners of ICAI, including the Chief Commissioner, the Secretary of State should invite the panel to rank in order of preference the candidates it puts forward, or otherwise express its recommendations as it thinks fit. In the longer term, we recommend the Committee be able to choose the Chief Commissioner from the list of candidates.

---

8 Commissioner for Public Appointments' Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies *(April 2012)*

9 Code of Practice, para 6.1.

10 Ranking is not precluded in the Commissioner for Public Appointments' Code of Practice.

Appointment of the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI)
Appendix 1: Chief Commissioner
Independent Commission for Aid Impact –
Information Pack for Applicants

Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI)
(Ref Number ICAI 2014 - 1)

Making an application

Thank you for your interest in the appointment of the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI). The attached Annexes provide details on the role, the person specification, the functions of ICAI and the selection process.

If you wish to make an application please send a CV, supporting letter and completed Monitoring form (attached) to the address below:

ICAI-Recruitment@dfid.gov.uk quoting the reference in the subject field before 12:00 (UK time) on 29 May 2014.

In making an application please note the following:

Supporting letter
The supporting letter is your opportunity to demonstrate how you meet each of the criteria set out in the Essential Selection Criteria (see below). How you choose to present the information is up to you. However, you should aim to provide specific and detailed examples that demonstrate how your knowledge and experience matches each of the criteria, and which describe what your role was in achieving a specific result. It will also benefit the selection panel if you can be clear which particular evidence you provide relates to which criteria. Providing separate paragraphs in relation to each criterion is common practice.

Declaration of interests and ensuring public confidence
If you have any business or personal interests that might be relevant to the work of ICAI and that could lead to a real or perceived conflict of interest were you to be appointed, please provide details in your supporting letter. Should you be successful in your application, if there is anything in your professional history, that if brought into the public domain, may cause embarrassment or disrepute to the organisation, please provide further details in your supporting letter. Failure to disclose such information could result in an appointment being terminated.

Please ensure your name and the name and reference number for the post are noted at the top of your letter, limit your letter to two pages, and type or write clearly in black ink.

CV
Please ensure your CV includes:

• your full name, title, home address, personal contact telephone numbers (land line and mobile) and personal email address
similar contact details for two referees who will support your application. One referee should be the person to whom you are/were accountable in your current/most recent appointment or position of employment. Please indicate the relationship of each referee to you. References will be requested for short-listed candidates prior to interview.

brief details of your current or most recent post, the dates you worked in the roles you highlight and whether any roles you currently hold are Ministerial appointments.

guaranteed interview scheme form (if required)

Please note that the Secretary of State is also seeking to appoint a Commissioner to ICAI. If you would also like to apply for the role of Commissioner, you may submit one CV and supporting letter to apply for both posts. Your application will however, be assessed separately against the requirement for the roles of Chief Commissioner and Commissioner. As a result, it is important that if you chose to submit a single supporting letter, you clearly set out your suitability for each role.

Monitoring form
Please complete the Monitoring Form. Diversity monitoring information will not be seen by the panel assessing your application.

Closing date for applications:
12:00 (UK time) on 29 May 2014. All applications will be acknowledged by email after the closing date.

Key facts about the post
Location: London

Remuneration: £548 a day plus reasonable travel expenses

Remuneration is taxable under Schedule E and subject to National Insurance contributions, deducted at source under PAYE before you are paid.

You may claim actual reasonable travel and subsistence expenses, which are properly and necessarily incurred in carrying out your role and responsibilities as an ICAI Commissioner

Time Commitment: expected to be in the region of 65 days per year

Contacts:
For further information regarding the selection process, please contact:

Email: ICAI-Recruitment@dfid.gov.uk

Please quote reference ICAI 2014 -1 on all correspondence. If you choose to apply, we would like to thank you in advance for your time and effort in making an application.
Annex A  Appointment of the Chief Commissioner for ICAI

Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICAI)

1. Appointing Body: DFID
2. Department: DFID
3. Location: Predominantly Central London. There is some overseas travel (typically 3-5 short visits of up to 1 week duration every year to oversee studies and meet beneficiaries)
4. Number of vacancies: 1
5. Remuneration: £548 a day
6. Time requirements: 15 days during initial months (until current Chief Commissioner steps down), then in the region of 65 days per annum from mid-2015
7. Closing Date: 12:00 (UK time) 29 May 2014.
8. Interviews: Expected to be 2nd-3rd July 2014

Additional Information The appointment will be for a fixed term of 4 years including an initial period as Chief Commissioner Designate to oversee the transition to the next phase of ICAI.

1. Vacancy Description

The Independent Commission for Aid Impact is an Advisory Non Departmental Public Body. Its task is to review the effectiveness and value for money of UK aid. It should operate in a way that is transparent and impartial, providing assurance to Parliament and taxpayers, and generating lessons and recommendations both on what works well and what could be improved. ICAI is led by a Chief Commissioner, who is independent of DFID and directly accountable to Parliament. The Chief Commissioner reports to the Chair of the International Development Committee. A recent Triennial Review of ICAI confirmed that there is a need for the continuation of the body beyond the current term and we are now seeking a new Chief Commissioner to manage the transition of ICAI into and through its next phase.

The successful applicant will be supported by a Secretariat and will head a small Board of Commissioners. The Board takes strategic decisions on what aspects of UK aid should be studied, oversees the work of a contracted service provider, and ensures the production and publication of high quality studies and reports.

2. Person Specification

An outstanding individual is sought to become the Chief Commissioner of ICAI. Able to command the confidence of stakeholders including the UK Parliament, aid beneficiaries and international development practitioners, he/she will become an effective leader of ICAI by establishing a strong direction and persuasive vision, while retaining objectivity. They will have the expertise to oversee production of high quality reports which are both accessible and professionally credible.
The Chief Commissioner should be able to demonstrate a good understanding of the international development field. They should have senior level experience in the public, private or voluntary sectors. The successful applicant will be able to demonstrate independence and objectivity; analyse and make judgements from complex data, and develop workable recommendations to improve the impact and effectiveness of international development programmes. A key requirement will be the ability to gain respect and keep the confidence of stakeholders through effective communication and influencing skills, which will involve engagement with Ministers, Parliament (including appearing before the International Development Committee at regular public evidence sessions), practitioners, the public and beneficiaries.

3. Chief Commissioner Selection Criteria

The successful candidate will have the profile to command respect and credibility with Parliament and external stakeholders and to demonstrate:

(1) Experience in an international development context as well as broad understanding of public policy and interest in international affairs

(2) Independence from Government and specific interest groups (where there could be potential conflicts of interest)

(3) Strong track record in scrutiny (private, public or voluntary sector experience)

(4) Ability to represent ICAI effectively to a broad range of domestic and international audiences including the UK Parliament

(5) Adherence to the Seven Principles of Public Life and the highest levels of professional integrity and propriety.

4. Role and responsibilities of the Chief Commissioner

The Chief Commissioner is responsible for the day to day operation, management and outputs of ICAI and for ensuring ICAI’s efficient and effective use of public funds. Responsibilities include:

- Overseeing delivery of high quality, accessible and professionally credible reviews through a contracted out service provider and supported by a small Secretariat.
- Representing ICAI and communicating its reports to the UK public and
- International stakeholders, through report publication and transparency of information on the ICAI website.
- Reporting to Parliament, including appearing before the International Development Committee at public evidence sessions.
- Contributing to strengthening the impact of UK aid, through monitoring implementation and providing feedback to Government;
• Maintaining the independence of ICAI, while managing the relationship with DFID and other government departments

• Managing the performance of the other Commissioners.

Further information about ICAI is available at: http://icai.independent.gov.uk/

Remuneration
• £548 a day

• Remuneration is taxable under Schedule E and subject to National Insurance contributions, deducted at source under PAYE before you are paid.

• you may claim actual reasonable travel and subsistence expenses, which are properly and necessarily incurred in carrying out your role and responsibilities as the Chief Commissioner of ICAI

Time and travel commitment
In the region of 65 days a year, including some overseas travel (typically 3-5 short visits of up to 1 week duration every year to oversee studies and meet beneficiaries). Note that this is an executive role and it is important for Commissioners to be able to devote significant time to this post, and to work within tight deadlines

Tenure of office
The Secretary of State determines the length of the appointment, which will be for up to a maximum of 4 years.

Accountability
The Chief Commissioner is appointed by the Secretary of State for International Development and will also be accountable to the International Development Committee for carrying out their duties and for their performance.

Conflict of Interests
You should particularly note the requirement for you to declare any private interests which may, or may be perceived to, conflict with the role and responsibilities as the Chief Commissioner of ICAI including any business interests and positions of authority outside of the role. If appointed, you will also be required to declare these interests on appointment which will be entered into a register which is available to the public.

Standards in public life
You will be expected to demonstrate high standards of corporate and personal conduct. All successful candidates’ will be asked to subscribe to the Code of Conduct for Board Members of Public Bodies. You can access this document at:


Diversity and equality of opportunity
DFID is committed to providing services which embrace diversity and which promote equality of opportunity. We also offer a guaranteed interview scheme (GIS) for disabled applicants who meet our minimum selection criteria. If you are applying under this scheme, please complete the attached GIS form. Applications can be accepted in alternative
formats. This candidate brief can be made available in different formats. For further information please contact ICAI-Recruitment@dfid.gov.uk or telephone Eilidh Simpson on 01355 843267.

We will not tolerate discrimination on any of the following: gender, marital status, sexual orientation, race, colour, nationality, religion, age, disability, HIV positivity, working pattern, caring responsibilities, trade union activity or political beliefs - or any other grounds.

Annex B The Role and Responsibilities of ICAI

Overview
The term of office of ICAI’s current Chief Commissioner comes to an end in mid-2015 and the Department for International Development (DFID) is now seeking to appoint a successor. The appointment will be made by the Secretary of State for International Development and the process is regulated by the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments (OCPA)

It is envisaged that there will be a substantial induction and handover period with the current Chief Commissioner and the successful candidate will be expected to be available to take up post, initially as Chief Commissioner Designate, from December 2014. It is anticipated that duties in the first months of appointment (the designate period) will include overseeing the competitive bidding process for new contractors to be in place by May 2015. The current Chief Commissioner will step down in July 2015.

About ICAI
The Coalition Government established ICAI in 2011, initially for a 4 year period, as the independent body responsible for scrutiny of Overseas Development Assistance (ODA) across the UK Government. It is an Advisory Non Departmental Public Body and is accountable to Parliament via the International Development Committee.

In December 2013, the Secretary of State for International Development confirmed in a Written Ministerial Statement the findings of the Triennial Review of ICAI which confirmed that there was a continuing need for independent scrutiny of the UK’s Official Development Assistance http://www.parliament.uk/documents/commons-vote-office/December%202013/17%20dec/17%20dec/9-DFID-CommissionforAid.pdf.

Aims and scope of ICAI
ICAI’s strategic aim is to provide independent scrutiny of UK aid spending, to promote the delivery of value for money for British taxpayers and the maximisation of the impact of aid.

ICAI has the mandate to scrutinise any UK aid classified as Official Development Assistance (ODA). ICAI commissions a range of reviews across DFID and other Government Departments.

Structure
ICAI is headed by a Chief Commissioner, leading a small Board of Commissioners who are independent from Government and report directly to Parliament, through the
International Development Select Committee. The Commissioners have a Secretariat and are supported by a contracted-out service provider.

Annex C

The Selection and Recruitment Process

All appointments are made following an open competition conducted in accordance with The Code of Practice published by the Commissioner for Public Appointments.

The Appointments Team will deal with your application as quickly as possible and will advise you of the likely timetable at each stage. After the closing date for applications:

- the panel will assess candidates’ CVs and supporting letters to determine who it believes best meets the criteria for the role, and who will be invited to interview. The panel will rely only on the information you provide in your CV and letter to assess whether you have the skills and experience required. Please ensure that you provide evidence to support how you meet all of the essential criteria.

- the selection panel will be chaired by a Public Appointments Assessor and will also comprise a Senior Official from the Department for International Development, a member of the International Development Committee, and an Independent Panel Member.

- your application may be “long-listed”, subject to the volume of applications received, before it is passed to the shortlisting panel for consideration. You should be aware that in this situation, your application might not be considered in full by all members of the panel. We may also use a search agency to carry out long-listing screening interviews. In this situation the agency will provide feedback to the panel on how candidates best meet the criteria.

- Reasonable travel expenses will be reimbursed to candidates who attend for interview. Applications for reimbursement should be made to ICAI-Recruitment@dfid.gov.uk.

- we anticipate that by mid-June 2014 the panel will have decided who will be invited for interview in July 2014.

- the panel will select for interview only the strongest applicants who they feel have demonstrated that they best meet the criteria set out in the person specification.

- if you are invited to interview and are unable to attend on the set date then an alternative date can only be offered at the discretion of the panel.

- the Appointments Team will write to let you know whether or not you have been invited to be interviewed. It is our intention that interviews will take place in a central London location.

- if invited to interview, the panel will invite you to make a brief presentation at the start of the interview and will go on to question you about your skills and experience, asking specific questions to assess whether you meet the criteria set out for the post.
Candidates who the panel believe are ‘appointable’, will be recommended to the Secretary of State who will make the final decision. The Secretary of State may choose to meet with appointable candidates before making a decision. If she does, she will meet all candidates and in the presence of the panel chair or their nominated representative. The time taken between interview and a final appointment decision being made can sometimes take a number of weeks. Candidates who have been interviewed will be kept informed of progress.

If you are successful you will be expected to appear in front of the UK Government International Development Committee for a Pre-appointment Scrutiny Hearing. The hearing will take place in November 2014.

Subject to a satisfactory report from the International Development Committee, you will receive a letter from the Secretary of State which will confirm the terms on which the appointment is offered. The initial appointment will be as Chief Commissioner Designate until the current Chief Commissioner stands down and then as Chief Commissioner to the Independent Commission for Aid Impact from July 2015.

If you are unsuccessful at interview or after the Hearing, you will be notified by the Appointments Team. We appreciate it takes a lot of time and effort to apply for roles and that feedback is a valuable part of the process. The letter will provide the details of who you may approach for feedback on your interview and application, if you so wish.

For further information on how we will manage the personal information that you have provided to us through your application, see Annex D.

Queries
For queries about your application, please contact ICAI-Recruitment@dfid.gov.uk.

Regulation by the Commissioner for Public Appointments
The Commissioner regulates and monitors appointments to public bodies to ensure procedures are fair, open and transparent and based on merit. More information about the role of the Commissioner and his Code of Practice is available from http://publicappointmentscommissioner.independent.gov.uk.

If you are not completely satisfied
DFID will aim to process all applications as quickly as possible and to treat all applicants with courtesy. If you have any complaints about the way your application has been handled, please contact enquiry@dfid.gov.uk. If after receiving a comprehensive response from the Department you are still concerned, you can write to the Commissioner for Public Appointments. Please contact: The Commissioner for Public Appointments 1 Horse Guards Road London SW1A 2HQ Tel: 0207 271 0849 Email: enquiries@publicappointmentscommissioner.org.

Annex D
How we will manage your personal information
Your personal information will be held in accordance with the Data Protection Act 1998. You will not receive unsolicited paper or electronic mail as a result of sending DFID any personal information. No personal information will be passed on to third parties for commercial purposes.

When we ask you for personal information, we promise we will:

- only ask for what we need, and not collect too much or irrelevant information
- ensure you know why we need it
- protect it and insofar as is possible, make sure nobody has access to it who shouldn't
- ensure you know what choice you have about giving us information
- make sure we don't keep it longer than necessary
- only use your information for the purposes you have authorised

We ask that you:

- provide us with accurate information
- inform us as soon as possible of any changes or if you notice mistakes in the information we hold about you

If you apply for a post, we will share some of the information you provide with the members of the selection panel for the post to which you are applying, so that your CV and supporting letter can be assessed.

The diversity monitoring information you provide will not be used in the selection process and will therefore not be shared with the selection panel assessing your application at any stage. However, the Commissioner for Public Appointments requires that selection panels review the political activity response at the interview stage. This in no way acts as a bar to appointment. Further information on this is provided in the attached Monitoring form.

The Commissioner for Public Appointments regulates and monitors appointments to public bodies to ensure procedures are fair. The Department for International Development is required by the Commissioner for Public Appointments to retain information about the people who apply for public appointments within his remit, and make this information available to him for audit purposes, if requested to do so. Information you provide in your application may therefore be made available to the Commissioner for Public Appointments and the Commissioner’s auditors on a confidential basis in order to help fulfil either the Commissioner’s formal complaints investigation role or for audit purposes.
Appendix 2: Letter from Secretary of State for International Development

I am writing to let you know that following an open competition run in accordance with the Commissioner for Public Appointments Code of Practice, I have now selected my preferred candidate, Alison Evans, to be the next Chief Commissioner of ICAI.

I am grateful for the Committee’s support and input throughout the process, including Fabian Hamilton’s participation in the appointment panel. We had an exceptionally strong field of candidates, a number of whom I judged appointable, and I am confident that Alison Evans can provide the leadership and vision which will enable ICAI to continue to enhance its role and impact over the coming years.

I understand that the International Development Select Committee have made arrangements for a pre-appointment scrutiny hearing for the preferred candidate in early November 2014. I look forward to seeing your report after the proceedings.
Appendix 3: CV of Dr Alison Evans

SUMMARY OF EXPERTISE

• **Analysis & Evaluation**: economist with 30 years of experience working on poverty, public policy, aid and development effectiveness. Reputation for big picture and policy-relevant thinking and an ability to bring together intellectual/academic rigour with a practical focus on delivery and results. Extensive advisory and evaluation experience across the bilateral and multilateral development system. Wide geographic experience spanning Asia, sub-Saharan Africa and South Eastern Europe.

• **Strategy & Leadership**: Over 20 years of experience leading strategy processes in a variety of roles and capacities, including as a senior economist at the World Bank and, most recently, as Executive Director of the Overseas Development Institute - the UK's leading international development and humanitarian affairs think tank.

• **Communication & Interpersonal Skills**: excellent communication skills with a track record in representing organisations nationally and internationally to governments, donors, the media and the general public. Strong public speaking and facilitation skills involving small and large groups.

• **Financial & Management Skills**: Leading an annual budget of £25m+ with 200 research and non-research staff at ODI. Led a major process of strategic repositioning, organisational change and office relocation all within a tightly managed budget. Extensive people, team and project management experience.

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE

**Independent Consultant**

Focus areas: development cooperation, development financing, evaluation, poverty and women’s empowerment.

April 2013 to present

Institutional Roles

- Non-Executive Director, Oxford Policy Management, UK
- Vice-Chair, Board of Trustees, BBC Media Action
- Board Member, North-South Institute, Ottawa, Canada
- External Grant Committee Member, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Denmark
- External Advisor, Program for Results Review, OPCS, World Bank
- Scientific Advisory Board Member, Centre for Global Cooperation, Duisberg, Germany
- Chair, ESRC/DFID Poverty Research Commissioning Panel

Recent Consultancy Projects

January – September 2014: Strategic Advisor, *German Multilateral Organisations Assessment – Methodology and Review*, BMZ/ adelphi
January – May 2014: Background Paper for World Bank South Asia Regional Strategy ‘Gender Equality and Shared Prosperity – What will it take?’

January-March 2014: External Reviewer – Multilateral Organisation Performance Assessment Network (MOPAN) 2.0


April – December 2013: External Reviewer, UK Multilateral Aid Review - Update

Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London UK May 2009 to April 2013

Executive Director

- Intellectual leadership and quality assurance across the full range of ODI programmes
- Leadership on strategy and policy development
- Leading the Senior Management Team to ensure that the Institute delivers on high-quality applied research, practical policy advice and policy focused dissemination and debate
- Leading on strategic institutional partnerships and fundraising
- Setting and delivering the annual budget and overseeing financial monitoring
- Leading on major external initiatives, engagement with media and representing ODI externally with stakeholders, including UK HMG and the UK Parliament
- Working with the ODI Board to ensure effective governance of the Institute
- Managing revenue growth of 30%, establishment growth of 40% and a major investment in a new fit-for-purpose office building

Additional Roles/Responsibilities:

- External Reviewer of the DFID UK Multilateral Aid Review
- Trustee of BBC Media Action (formerly BBC World Service Trust)
- Chair of the BSI Advisory Board
- Chair of the HPG, Advisory Board
- Network Council Member Climate Change and Development Knowledge Network (CDKN)
- Advisory Board member World Development Report 2012
- Member of the World Bank’s Advisory Council on Gender 2011/12
- Member of the Oxford University International Development Department Council 2010-2013
- External advisor World Bank, IEG PRSC Evaluation
- External advisor World Bank, IEG Trust Fund Evaluation
- External advisor WFP School Feeding Programme Evaluation
- External reviewer Global Partnership for Education
• Numerous appearances at UK Parliamentary Select Committees: IDC, PAC and House of Lords Economic Affairs Committee.

**Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London. UK August 2006 to April 2009**

*Director of Programmes, Poverty and Public Policy Group*

• Leading and managing a group of 30 researchers and support staff in four programme teams with an annual turnover of +/- £2.5 million.
• Leading a restructuring of programme teams to improve strategic focus and internal coherence plus a stronger focus on financial and business processes as the basis for improving financial performance.
• Senior management team member with lead responsibility for the ‘Future of Aid’ cross cutting theme and the ODI Annual Retreat
• High level briefings of UK and international policy makers and development representatives from political parties
• Senior management training 2007

**Projects:**

• Chair of the Food Security Panel of the Australian Research Awards 2008;
• Review of the *Uganda Joint Assistance Strategy* (DFID);
• Co-organiser of the Dutch-World Bank conference on the ‘Future of the World Bank’;
• Member of the Transatlantic Task Force on Development (GMF);
• Team Leader: *Review of Poverty and Social Impact Analysis* (World Bank);
• Team Leader *Review of SWAps in Agriculture and Rural Development* (Global Donor Platform on Rural Development),
• Team Leader: *Design of the Governance and Poverty Policy Analysis and Advice Programme Vietnam* (DFID);
• Co-author of IFAD’s 2007 Annual Review of Results
• Facilitator of the *Ghana Joint Assistance Strategy* (DFID).

**Institute of Development Studies, Brighton. UK July 2005-July 2006**

*Research Fellow*

• Theme leader on ‘Aid’
• Team Leader - *Independent Evaluation of Rwanda’s PRSP 2002-2005*.
• Lecturer on the MPhil Development Studies, MA Governance and MA Gender
• Presented at Select Committee briefings, House of Commons seminars and workshops.

**Independent Consultant, UK June 2000-July 2005**

*Consultant/Advisor*

• Lead Reviewer Donor Harmonisation in Albania, November 2004, DFID/EC.
• Lead Reviewer Donor Harmonisation in Republic of Serbia May 2004, Govt. of Serbia.
• **Lead The Design and Application of MTEFs and their Evolving Linkages with PRSPs.** Eight country study (Team manager, and co-author of final synthesis report with Malcolm Holmes) DFID UK/ODI, 2002/3.
• SPA 2002 Background Paper on Donor Alignment and General Budget Support for SPA Technical Missions on Coordination and Harmonisation.
• Review of DFID Support to the Tanzania Poverty Monitoring System, 2002
• SPA/World Bank 2001 Stocktake of Progress in Implementing the SPA 5 Agenda
• Annual Policy and Performance Review (APPR) and Advisor on the Country Assistance Plan Process, DFID Tanzania, 2001-3.

**World Bank, Washington DC** September 1994 – April 2000

*Senior Economist and Senior Evaluation Specialist*

• Senior Evaluation Specialist - Task manager: The Annual Review of Development Effectiveness 1997/8, OED
• Co-Author and Core Team Member- World Development Report Team 1997 - The State in a Changing World.
• Economist- East Asia and Pacific, Country Operations Division 1 – Cambodia.
• Economist - Poverty and Social Policy Department
• Team member of the Kazakhstan Social Protection Project.

**University of Sussex, Brighton. UK** September 1990 – August 1994

*Lecturer in Economics*

• Teaching undergraduate and graduate courses in microeconomics, labour economics, development economics, gender and development.
• Co-course director - MA Economics (Development) 1993/4

**Bristol City Council, UK** September 1989 – August 1990

*Economist, Planning Department*
Institute of Development Studies, Brighton. UK

Research Officer

QUALIFICATIONS


Gladstone Memorial Prize for best 3rd Year Economics Dissertation.
Appendix 4: DFID Summary of recruitment process

Summary of recruitment process – ICAI Chief Commissioner

1. The recruitment was conducted in accordance with OCPA guidelines. Post advertised on Public Appointments website. Search agency engaged to identify possible candidates. Secretary of State and International Development Committee were also asked to suggest names of possible candidates.

2. 26 applications were received. 19 candidates responded to the diversity questionnaire. Of those 19, sixteen were male and three female. Two came from a BME background, and two declared themselves as having a disability. The panel short-listed for interview four candidates (two males and two females). None of the four declared themselves as from a BME background or as having a disability.

3. The Selection Panel consisted of:
   - John Knight, Panel Chair nominated by the Commissioner for Public Appointments;
   - Richard Calvert DFID Director General, Finance and Corporate Services;
   - Fabian Hamilton MP, International Development Select Committee
   - Tina Fordham, Citigroup; the independent member of the panel.

4. The Selection Panel found all 4 candidates interviewed to be appointable and presented the list of appointable candidates (unranked) to the Secretary of State.

5. The Secretary of State spoke to all 4 candidates separately and subsequently selected Alison Evans as her preferred candidate.

6. The Secretary of State wrote to the Chair of the International Development Committee notifying the Committee of her choice of preferred candidate.
Appendix 5: Letter from Secretary of State to Fabian Hamilton MP dated 12 June 2014

Thank you for your letter of 20 May 2014 about the recruitment process for ICAI’s Commissioners.

It is always challenging to estimate exactly how much of the Chief Commissioner and Commissioners’ time will be needed—particularly when we expect the appointments to last for 4 years over which time requirements may change. In order to maintain some flexibility, the advertisements for the role of Chief Commissioner and Commissioners specified that time requirements would be “in the region of” 65 and 55 days respectively.

As, the current Chief Commissioner knows, DFID has been very open to change requests during his current tenure and has not only increased the number of available days, but also adjusted the distribution of days between the Chief Commissioner and his Board. I can assure you that there will continue to be room for some flexibility during the next phase of ICAI.
Appendix 6: Letter from Secretary of State to Rt Hon Sir Malcolm Bruce MP dated 14 October 2014

Further to our exchanges of letters this year about the recruitment of new Commissioners for the next phase of ICAI, I am writing to update you on the process that is now under way for the recruitment of Commissioners.

Following the earlier advertisement for one or two of the Commissioner posts, DFID was disappointed not to have attracted the very high calibre of candidates that we had expected. We are now planning to re-advertise all three Commissioner posts with a view to attracting a more suitable mix of candidates. I am grateful to the IDC for volunteering a member to sit on the Commissioner recruitment panel and am attaching a proposed timetable for the process. We have tentatively scheduled the interviews early in December.

I am now attaching the job specification for the appointments which will be advertised shortly.

The posts will be advertised on the OCPA website and in the press including in the Economist and Sunday Times.

With many thanks for your continuing engagement in this important process.
Formal Minutes

Tuesday 9 December 2014

Members present:

Sir Malcolm Bruce, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce
Jeremy Lefroy
Mr Michael McCann
Chris White

Pauline Latham
Sir Peter Luff
Fiona O’Donnell

Draft Report, *(Pre-Appointment hearing)* proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*Ordered*, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 15 read and agreed to.

Annex and Summary agreed to.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Seventh Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

*Ordered*, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No. 134.

Adjourned till Thursday 11 October at 10.00 am
Witnesses

The following witnesses gave evidence. Transcripts can be viewed on the Committee’s inquiry page at Appointment of the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact (published later)

**Tuesday 9 December 2014**

**Dr Alison Evans**, the Government’s proposed candidate for the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact

Published written evidence

The following written evidence was received and can be viewed on the Committee’s inquiry web page at Pre-Appointment hearing ICAI. ICA numbers are generated by the evidence processing system and so may not be complete.

1  Independent Commission for Aid Impact (ICA0001)
# List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the Committee’s website at [www.parliament.uk/indcom](http://www.parliament.uk/indcom).

The reference number of the Government’s response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

### Session 2014–15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Report</th>
<th>UK Support for Humanitarian Relief in the Middle East</th>
<th>HC 248 (673)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Report</td>
<td>Scrutiny of Government’s UK Strategic Export Controls Annual Report 2012, the Government’s Quarterly Reports from October 2012 to September 2013, and the Government’s policies on arms exports and international arms control issues</td>
<td>HC 186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Report</td>
<td>The UK’s Development Work in the Occupied Palestinian Territories</td>
<td>HC 565 (756)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth Report</td>
<td>Strengthening Health Systems in Developing Countries</td>
<td>HC 246 (816)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth Report</td>
<td>Recovery and Development in Sierra Leone &amp; Liberia</td>
<td>HC 247 (863)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Session 2013–14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Report</th>
<th>Global Food Security</th>
<th>HC 176 (626)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fourth Report</td>
<td>Multilateral Aid Review</td>
<td>HC 349 (694)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth Report</td>
<td>ICAI’s Annual Report 2012-13</td>
<td>HC 566 (946)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth Report</td>
<td>Implications for development in the event of Scotland becoming an independent country</td>
<td>HC 692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ninth Report</td>
<td>Democracy and Development in Burma</td>
<td>HC 821</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Eleventh Report | Disability and Development | HC 947 (336)

**Session 2012–13**

| First Report | DFID's contribution to the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria | HC 126 (609) |
| Third Report | The Development Situation in Malawi | HC 118 (641) |
| Fourth Report | Tax in Developing Countries: Increasing Resources for Development | HC 130 (708) |
| Fifth Report | DFID's programme in Zambia | HC 119 (759) |
| Sixth Report | Afghanistan: Development progress and prospects after 2014 | HC 403 (862) |
| Seventh Report | UK Aid to Rwanda | HC 726 (949) |
| Eighth Report | Post-2015 Development Goals | HC 657 (1065) |
| Ninth Report | Department for International Development's Annual Report and Accounts 2011–12 | HC 751 (1098) |
| Tenth Report | Pakistan | HC 725 |

**Session 2010–12**

<p>| First Report | Appointment of the Chief Commissioner of the Independent Commission for Aid Impact | HC 551 |
| Second Report | The 2010 Millennium Development Goals Review Summit | HC 534 (HC 959) |
| Fourth Report | The World Bank | HC 999 (1044) |
| Fifth Report | The Future of CDC | HC 607 (1045) |
| Seventh Report | The Humanitarian Response to the Pakistan Floods | HC 615 (1435) |
| Eighth Report | The Future of DFID's Programme in India | HC 616 (1486) |
| Ninth Report | DFID's Role in Building Infrastructure in Developing Countries | HC 848 (1721) |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenth Report</th>
<th>The Closure of DFID’s Bilateral Aid Programme in Burundi</th>
<th>HC 1134 (1730)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eleventh Report</td>
<td>Financial Crime and Development</td>
<td>HC 847 (1859)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twelfth Report</td>
<td>Working Effectively in Fragile and Conflict–Affected States: DRC and Rwanda</td>
<td>HC 1133 (1872)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifteenth Report</td>
<td>South Sudan: Prospects for Peace and Development</td>
<td>HC 1570 (426)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixteenth Report</td>
<td>EU Development Assistance</td>
<td>HC 1680 (427)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>